



**ADA UNIVERSITY**

**SCHOOL OF PUBLIC AND INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS**

**MASTER OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION**

**Evaluation Public Service Delivery in Azerbaijan: A Comprehensive  
Study of Challenges, Policy Alternatives, and Evaluation of ASAN  
service and E-Government Implementation**

Baku, Azerbaijan

May 20, 2023

## DECLARATION OF AUTHENTICITY

We, below mentioned students of MPA2023, have read and understand the policy of ADA University on plagiarism. For greater certainty, we confirm that the paper, entitled **“Evaluation Public Service Delivery in Azerbaijan: A Comprehensive Study of Challenges, Policy Alternatives, and Evaluation of ASAN service and E-Government Implementation”** is a product of our research and contains our analysis and proposals.

Signed: Orkhan Ismayilov

Signed: Shahriyar Mustafayev

Signed: Khagan Hummatzade

## **Abstract**

It is very important to ensure efficiency and transparency in the provision of public services, to develop mechanisms for monitoring and complaining about public services, and to improve the efficiency and quality of public services. Public services are designed to enhance citizens' living conditions and solve their problems more efficiently and quickly.

Public service evaluation is important for several reasons. It is essential for ensuring accountability, improving program outcomes, informing policy decisions, building public trust, and promoting a culture of learning and continuous improvement in government. The challenges, and propose solutions.

**Keywords:** *public services, evaluation of public services, evaluation models, monitoring, public trust, policy decision*

## **List of abbreviation**

ASAN	Azerbaijan Service and Assessment Network
SIM	Subscriber Identity Module
IT	Information Technology
PPP	Public-Private Partnerships
GIS	Geographic Information System
M2M	Machine to machine
TTIP	The Transatlantic Trade and Investment Partnership
US	United States
APP	Application

# Table of Contents

## Contents

Chapter 1: Introduction .....	5
Methodology .....	8
Chapter 2: Problem Description .....	11
2.1. Financial Challenges in Public Sector: Navigating Revenue Instability and Fiscal Constraints .....	12
2.2. Inefficiencies and Accessibility Barriers in Public Service Provision: A Case Study of ASAN Service in Azerbaijan .....	15
2.3. Addressing Operational, Legal, and Ethical Challenges in E-Government Implementation .....	19
Chapter 3: Policy Alternatives .....	26
3.1. Encouraging Public-Private Partnerships.....	26
3.2 Developing Feedback and Complaint Mechanisms in Azerbaijan.....	29
3.3 Municipality Mobile App Design .....	30
3.4 Improvement of e-Procurement Mechanism and Application .....	32
Chapter 4. Evaluation of Policy Alternatives.....	34
Chapter 5. Conclusion and Recommendation.....	44
REFERENCES.....	47
Appendix.....	56

## Chapter 1: Introduction

Successful governance and efficient public administration rely heavily on objective assessments of public services. Improved program results, educated policy choices, and public confidence in government are all outcomes that benefit from this (Zeynalov, 2021). Since its inception in 2012, the Azerbaijan Service and Assessment Network (ASAN service) has had a profound effect on how government services are evaluated and provided across the nation (Jafarli, 2021). Evaluating public services is essential because it provides evidence that governments are being transparent and accountable, determines whether or not their initiatives are successful, and highlights problem areas. Evidence from evaluation may be used to guide policy choices, and it can also have a beneficial effect on people's faith in their government. In addition, an assessment may facilitate the development of a learning and improvement culture in public administration. The ASAN Service in Azerbaijan conducts yearly evaluations of public services according to the criteria of legality, objectivity, openness, and professionalism. The State Agency for Public Service and Social Innovations under the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan established the ASAN service index in 2014 to begin assessing the quality of public services in the country. President Ilham Aliyev showed in Decree No. 262 that establishing this index is a means of comparing the quality of services provided to different types of customers internationally. The ASAN service is a government agency in Azerbaijan that works via a network of centers to provide a variety of services to the public in a unified and effective manner (Zeynalov, 2021). Using cutting-edge technical advancements, the ASAN service was established to boost government openness, efficiency, and public happiness (Murteza, 2021). Customer focus, technological innovation,

and a dedication to ongoing review have all contributed to ASAN service's meteoric rise to prominence as an integral part of Azerbaijan's public service landscape.

The ASAN service coordinates the delivery of services among government agencies and oversees the process through which these services are evaluated. Lawfulness, objectivity, openness, and professionalism are maintained yearly in Azerbaijan's review of the public sector. The goal of the Azerbaijani model of the government's system for delivering services is to guarantee the consistent and coordinated delivery of services by state institutions. Huseynova (2014) cites public involvement in e-government service assessment as a guiding concept of the ASAN service. According to "About Us - ASAN," citizens' comments are "considered a valuable source of information" for gauging the efficacy of e-services and making "informed decisions" on how to better provide such services. As part of its review process, the ASAN service takes into account user responses to online surveys and social media platforms (Alguliyev et al, 2018) to gauge public satisfaction. The ASAN service has been able to develop by listening to its users and using their feedback to fix any problems they find.

The high rate of uptake by Azerbaijani citizens demonstrates the service's effectiveness. Over 37 million total applications have been submitted to the ASAN service since its inception in 2012 (Zeynalov, 2021). The fact that ASAN is so widely used likely stems from the fact that its web platform is so simple to utilize. Thousands of people visit the official ASAN service website every day, and its social media sites have a sizable following thanks to the public who actively submit questions and requests there and get prompt responses (Murteza, 2021). The dedication of the ASAN service to ongoing development through assessment and feedback is a major factor in the high levels of community

participation and satisfaction it has achieved. But unfortunately, **few public sector uses this feedback system** which causes wall between organizations and citizens.

With the use of the ASAN Service, government agencies may provide their services independently. Banks, insurance companies, hospitals, doctors, lawyers, and translators are all examples of specialized public services provided by state institutions. In addition, cutting-edge tools have been used to boost productivity, including online queuing and e-application features.

The ASAN Service has evolved into a trustworthy platform devoid of graft that helps the public have more faith in government agencies. More than half a million people have liked its Facebook page and it has earned widespread praise from individuals (Zeynalov, 2021). On its Facebook page, residents may submit their inquiries and get prompt responses. According to the Azerbaijani Service and Assessment Network (ASAN), 2016, the recent years' success in the field of state agencies in Azerbaijan is the result of long-term projects conducted with the establishment of E-government and the utilization of e-services within the framework of "ASAN service," per the order of the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan. When evaluating the efficacy and efficiency of e-services, the ASAN service doesn't rely only on user input (Alguliyev et al, 2018). The review is conducted by ethical standards of legality, objectivity, openness, and professionalism.

Modern technologies like online queuing and e-application features have been used to increase efficiency, and the ASAN Service paves the way for state organizations to directly supply their services. Citizens have given the ASAN Service overwhelmingly good reviews since it has become a trustworthy, corruption-free platform that inspires faith in government. (Khan, 2016) In recent years, the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan has issued orders

for the formation of E-government and the use of e-services within the scope of the "ASAN service," both of which have contributed to the improvement of state agencies in Azerbaijan. Specialists from "ADA" University collaborated to study foreign examples of evaluating customer service in different industries, from which the "ASAN service index" was developed. The purpose of this study is to assess the quality and efficiency of public service delivery in Azerbaijan and to provide assessment models to that end. The purpose of this investigation is to analyze the present public service delivery system in Azerbaijan and provide recommendations for how it might be improved to better meet the requirements of its population. The study's overarching purpose is to provide legislators and public service managers in Azerbaijan with actionable ideas that will raise citizen happiness with government services and improve the quality of such services. Improving public service delivery, using digital methods, overcoming operational inefficiencies, and providing efficient, accessible, and effective and high quality services to the people of Azerbaijan is the central focus of the policy problem.

## Methodology

The purpose of this capstone project is to analyze Azerbaijan's public services in terms of transparency, accessibility, legal, budget and provide policy alternatives for improvement. This report describes the procedures used during data collecting and analysis. Three semi-structured in-depth interviews with industry specialists were done using qualitative research methods so that we could learn more about the subject. To back up our statements, we gathered secondary data from sources like academic journals and other relevant information.

We used a qualitative approach to the study to accomplish our goals. The structure we came up with helped us learn more about the topic and the varying opinions held by professionals in the field. Three experts from various areas of public service were interviewed in-depth using a semi-structured interview format. Each expert was interviewed at the same time, and they were all given an identical set of questions. Before the interviews, the experts were given permission papers and the questions would be prepared in advance.

Both primary and secondary information were used in the analysis. Expert interviews served as the major source of information, with supplementary data coming from books, papers, and reports. We relied on these sources to back up our arguments and provide a thorough assessment of Azerbaijan's public sector. Three in-depth, semi-structured interviews with professionals in the public service sector were undertaken. Deputy Head of the Service Design and Evaluation Department, was our first interviewee. Senior Specialist in Service Design and Evaluation, was our second interviewee. Chief Inspector of one of the government agencies, was our last interviewee. All of the experts were asked an identical set of predetermined following questions throughout the interviews:

1. Please describe the nature of your present position and the duties you perform.
2. What role does your agency play in enhancing Azerbaijan's public service infrastructure?
3. Can you tell us about some of the most challenging situations you have encountered in your work?
4. How do you evaluate the effectiveness of your department's initiatives to enhance the delivery of public services?

5. What is a recent effort your agency has made to better the delivery of public services?
6. How can you make sure that people of every socioeconomic class can take advantage of your organization's services?
7. How does your organisation guarantee the quality and efficacy of its services?
8. How do you keep informed of what's new and effective in the realm of public service provision?
9. What are some ways that your organisation has used technology to enhance service delivery?
10. How can you guarantee that your organization's services are provided in an accessible and transparent manner?

To back up our statements and provide a thorough assessment of Azerbaijan's public services, we drew on secondary data as well. The research relied on secondary sources, such as scholarly articles, books, articles and reports on the provision of public services in Azerbaijan. The research used these resources to acquire data and bolster the claims made in it. The study's overarching goal was to give an in-depth examination of Azerbaijan's public sector and provide policy options by drawing on primary data collected via expert interviews and secondary data collected from a variety of sources.

The policy document included five sections. The opening chapter laid forth the study's rationale and methods. Chapter 2 defined the issue at hand, discussed the existing state of affairs in Azerbaijan, outlined the difficulties that lie ahead, and surveyed international best practices in this area. The third chapter provided policy ideas and discussed

possible answers to the challenge. The effectiveness, efficiency, equity, feasibility, and adaptability of the policy options were assessed in the fourth chapter. The study of policy options led to the conclusion and suggestions offered in the fifth chapter.

## Chapter 2: Problem Description

Citizens are the primary focus of state policy, which has as its primary objective the establishment of an efficient public administration. This is an essential precondition for Azerbaijan to move on to the next stage of its development. The degree to which it is satisfied is a crucial measure of both the quality and the convenience of public services. In tandem with the rapid expansion of all aspects of public life, there is a concerted effort being put out toward achieving the goals of enhancing human resources and ensuring openness (Guliyev, 2015). The construction of "ASAN service" centers under the aegis of the State Agency for Citizen Services and Social Innovations is one of the main initiatives that is being taken to modernize public administration, promote transparency, and create a new style of management. The agency was established to increase transparency in governmental institutions, to provide better and more comfortable services to citizens in a new manner and with the application of contemporary innovations, to comply with ethical rules regarding citizens, and to ensure that citizens are satisfied with the services they receive (Asgarova, 2020). It is abundantly evident that this is the case given that there are now "ASAN service" centers operating under the aegis of the State Agency for Citizen Services and Social Innovations under the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan. The founding of the agency is significant for the growth of "citizen-officer" interactions, as well as the emergence of a new way of thinking and behaving on the part of public officials, as a result of these

developments. It is common knowledge that when many government agencies provide the same services to citizens, a healthy competitive atmosphere is established between those agencies. This environment helps to eliminate corruption and delay, as well as ensures that citizens are happy with the services they get (Iskandarli, 2020). Because this aspect was taken into consideration throughout the process of reform, "ASAN service" centers have been established. These centers house the services of more than one institution inside a single establishment. In the realm of public administration, the ASAN service is first and foremost an example of an innovative approach. In general, whenever there is an invention, there is also an improvement, and it is more apparent when there is an improvement. This subject is significant not just from an applied standpoint, but also because it is an essential aspect of the theoretical study that we are doing. This demonstrates the need of analyzing the efficiency of public administration.

## 2.1. Financial Challenges in Public Sector: Navigating Revenue Instability and Fiscal Constraints

Financial difficulties have been a major barrier to providing high-quality public services in Azerbaijan's public sector. Researching the circumstances under which state income must exist is the most critical problem. In the first place, it's important for keeping up with the ever-growing demands of manufacturing. Secondly, it is not connected to the control of this production but rather results from the necessity of preserving and protecting the current social and administrative order. These and other determinants of the need for state revenue are not the same as the circumstance that produces it. Because productive public sector employment and economic expansion are the primary drivers of state budget surpluses. There can be no discussion of the proper generation of state income from an economic

standpoint if the level of output is insufficient to meet even the most basic demands of people in the first distribution of national income. As a result, the fundamental prerequisites for the generation of state revenues are determinants of economic growth and growing the productive force of labor (Yoon, 2019). Because it is an objective need of the current economic system and structure that states generate their revenues. There is currently no working economic system or model that would do this without tax from the government. Furthermore, it is highly improbable that any future model will be able to completely replace state revenues. Allocation of national revenue in its broadest meaning is implicit in the original allocation of state income. Due to their shared ownership, the relationship between state revenues and those of state-owned firms is conditional. Here, the distribution of wealth between the state and businesses is influenced by several factors, including a) the size and scope of the net income generated; b) the national economy's need for money and other resources (to be collected); c) the needs of the general public and other members of society. All else being equal, the level of income nationalization is determined by the aforementioned aggregate factors. Under the conditions of market relations, the degree of nationalization (centralization) of revenues has significantly decreased. State and business revenues need to be in harmony, and this is achieved in part through non-tax revenues in addition to profit margins.

The lack of available financial resources for funding the public sector is a major problem plaguing Azerbaijan's governmental sector. The country's economy is highly dependent on oil and gas exports, leaving it susceptible to external shocks despite the government's attempts to enhance income creation and diversify the economy. Recession and

massive cuts in public expenditure were inevitable results of 2014's precipitous drop in oil prices, which had a profound effect on the country's economy. ([Bakuresearchinstitute, 2020](#))

Despite the recent uptick in oil prices, the government has been very frugal in its expenditures, opting instead to prioritize debt reduction and fiscal consolidation. According to Yoon (2019), the Azerbaijani administration has acknowledged the need to improve the efficiency of public spending but has not taken many considerable concrete steps to do so. In the public sector in Azerbaijan, a lack of some trained workers has caused a deficiency of capability and experience in essential domains including finance, procurement, and project management.

The spread of the Covid-19 virus has shed light on the government's ongoing financial struggles, particularly in the area of crisis management, highlighting the need of digitizing Azerbaijan's private sector and ensuring its long-term viability. Tax revenues have dropped as a consequence of the pandemic, as pointed out by Gurbanov et al. (2022). The authors claim that the public sector's financial difficulties may be alleviated with the aid of digitization. By increasing openness and accountability in government budgeting, digitization has the potential to both improve the effectiveness of publicly provided services and decrease instances of corruption.

The government of Azerbaijan has adopted several measures in response to the public sector's financial troubles. One of the moves being made is to provide government services over the Internet. According to Yoon (2019), the government has set up an e-government platform so that citizens may have easy online access to various government services. The platform has improved transparency and accountability in government finance, leading to better service delivery and less wasteful spending. The Azerbaijan Mortgage Fund (AMF)

was established in 2005 with the goals of increasing access to long-term mortgage loans and facilitating the recruitment of local and foreign financial resources for housing finance. According to Gurbanov et al. (2022), the AMF has been crucial in ensuring that people in Azerbaijan may get mortgages at reasonable rates. However, AMF revenue has decreased because of the current downturn in oil prices, which threatens the fund's long-term survival. The government of Azerbaijan has adopted several measures in response to the public sector's financial troubles. One of the moves being made is to provide government services over the Internet. According to Yoon (2019), the government has set up an e-government platform so that citizens may have easy online access to various government services. The platform has improved transparency and accountability in government finance, leading to better service delivery and less wasteful spending. Improvements in fiscal management are another result of administrative action. Bashirov (2021) claims that new legislation has been passed to make the management of public finances more transparent and accountable. To further guarantee that public sector financial management regulations were followed, the State Financial Control Service was also established.

## 2.2. Inefficiencies and Accessibility Barriers in Public Service Provision:

### A Case Study of ASAN Service in Azerbaijan

A necessary component of effective administration is the delivery of public services that are both user-friendly and comprehensive. The provision of public services in Azerbaijan has been given a boost in both quality and efficiency thanks to the government's implementation of the ASAN Service. The ASAN Service Index was developed so that an assessment of how successful the ASAN Service is could be made, along with suggestions for its further development ( Yusifov, & Gurbanli, 2018). As our second interview **with**

**Senior Specialist in Service Design and Evaluation** indicate that the ASAN service measures performance, compares itself to industry standards, and conducts customer satisfaction surveys to evaluate its efficacy and find ways to enhance its offerings. The results of the assessment are used to guide policy choices, optimize resource use, and enhance service quality. ASAN service has been able to improve its offerings and meet the shifting demands of its constituents thanks to an evidence-based method of assessment. On the other hand, the ASAN Service is confronted with several obstacles that limit its capacity to provide Azerbaijani residents with public services that are both effective and easily accessible. In this article, we will discuss some of the most significant issues that the ASAN Service in Azerbaijan is now experiencing, as well as some potential solutions to those challenges.

Lack of public knowledge and education about the services that are provided by the ASAN Service is one of the key issues that are faced by the organization. The ASAN Service can provide a variety of services, some of which include the issue of passports, licenses to drive, and identification cards, among other things. The ASAN Service has to enhance the amount of work it puts into public outreach so that more people are aware of the services it provides and how to use them. Public service announcements, billboards, and social media campaigns are all viable options for accomplishing this goal. Ibadoghlu and Bayramov (2019) conducted research in which they found that the execution of the National Action Plan on Promotion of the Open Government Initiative in Azerbaijan for 2016-2018 was not properly performed, and the ASAN Service did not reach certain of its aims. As a result, it is essential for the ASAN Service to regularly examine and analyze the methods that it uses to provide service to customers. This may be accomplished by consistent monitoring and assessment of its operations, surveys designed to gauge the level of happiness experienced by customers,

and feedback systems. An opinion survey known as an Exit poll is now being conducted at Asan service. (The State Agency for Public Service and Social Innovations under the president of the Republic of Azerbaijan, 2013) Citizens are allowed to provide feedback about the quality of the services provided at the centres using this technology. The existing issues in providing public services may be eliminated with the use of this application form, which investigates the perspectives of those who applied to the centre about the services that were supplied to them. This application form investigates the perspectives of those who sought out the centre's services to learn more about the quality of such services.

The ASAN Service has a substantial challenge in overcoming the lack of an all-encompassing legal framework. The ASAN Service is subject to a wide range of laws and regulations, although it is not mandated to operate under any specific legislative framework. This might cause discrepancies in service delivery because of confusion and uncertainty regarding the ASAN Service's role and responsibilities. The government should establish a comprehensive legal framework that defines the role, responsibilities, and processes of the ASAN Service. The ASAN Service also faces the challenge of insufficient funding, which must be resolved. The ASAN Service is an expensive and resource-intensive endeavor that requires significant financial and other investments. The government should raise the financing it provides for the ASAN Service to ensure its continuing operation and financial sustainability (Mulgan, & Albury, 2003). To supplement its present budget, the ASAN Service should also look at several other possible revenue streams, such as public-private partnerships. Another key obstacle that the ASAN Service must contend with is the absence of a coordinated strategy for the delivery of services. The ASAN Service is coordinated across a wide variety of government ministries and departments, each of which has its

policies and procedures to follow. This may result in misunderstandings as well as delays in the provision of services. It is recommended that the ASAN Service move toward a method of service delivery that is more coordinated, in which all government agencies and departments collaborate to produce public services that are both effective and easily accessible.

Accessibility is a basic right that belongs to all individuals, especially those who have physical or mental limitations as well as senior citizens. Regrettably, the ASAN Service is confronted with a huge obstacle when attempting to assist these vulnerable demographic groups. The absence of easily accessible ASAN Service Centers is one of the most significant obstacles. It is difficult for persons with disabilities and the elderly to access public services since many facilities were not planned with accessibility in mind during the construction process. For instance, those who rely on wheelchairs may find it challenging or even impossible to access an ASAN Service center that includes stairs going up to the front door of the facility. It may be difficult for older people to move about, which might make it difficult for them to climb stairs or travel a great distance to visit an ASAN Service facility.

Asan Imza (mobile signature), was introduced to the general public in 2013, was the most ground-breaking invention of that year. To use e-services, confirming one's identity and digitally signing documents may be accomplished via the use of a mobile signature. In reality, Asan Imza is a mobile SIM card that may be used to access all of the services that are available in the electronic world (Asgarova, 2020). It is designed for usage not just in Azerbaijan but also elsewhere in the world. In addition to not posing any danger to human health, this system boosts the national security system, making it better able to combat crime and other unfavorable circumstances. On the other hand, it is important to point out that

acquiring an electronic signature is fraught with significant challenges. As a result, one can see that there are significant issues with the service costs that are necessary for the acquisition and implementation of the electronic signature. That is to say, even though the procedure is referred to as Easy in the signature, it is not really simple. It is important to keep in mind that cell providers are the ones responsible for the difficulties that occur while providing electronic signatures. From this vantage point, I believe that this matter needs to be investigated, and suitable modifications ought to be implemented.

In summing up, the ASAN Service is an important part of the infrastructure that supports the provision of public services in Azerbaijan. Despite this, it is unable to deliver public services that are both effective and easily accessible due to the many obstacles it must overcome. Increased public awareness efforts, the establishment of a complete legislative framework, solid financing, the adoption of a more coordinated approach to service delivery, and prioritization of accessibility for disadvantaged groups are all necessary steps for the ASAN Service to take in order to overcome these problems. By resolving these issues, the ASAN Service will be able to make further strides in enhancing the level of quality and effectiveness of the provision of public services in Azerbaijan.

### 2.3. Addressing Operational, Legal, and Ethical Challenges in E-Government Implementation

The struggle against corruption has reached a new level in the contemporary era. The state's anti-corruption strategy is not sidelined while it refines its management practices, despite the fact that the approaches it has so far taken are now considered conventional wisdom. Despite the fact that it's obvious no society is completely free of corruption, it shouldn't make the struggle any less important. The "disease" has been successfully

eradicated in developed nations. The Internet is becoming an essential tool in the fight against corruption and the establishment of open government practices. As one of the main focuses of Azerbaijan's strategy of constant and sustainable growth, e-government has become an established component of the country's social and economic fabric (Huseynova & Mazanova, 2020). E-government, as defined by the United Nations, is the delivery of government services and information to citizens via the use of information and communication technologies. There have been significant advancements in this area during the last decade. Azerbaijan's e-government legal framework is being developed with the help of the developed world's experience and the advice of international organizations.

There are several issues with e-government, despite its many benefits to governmental agencies and the general population. The right identification and resolution of issues are essential for any e-government program to succeed. Problems with e-government may arise in any nation, and even in different parts of the same country. Now we must ask: what are the drawbacks of e-government? Numerous scholars have tackled and investigated facets of e-government in the literature. Another major issue is the secrecy surrounding Azerbaijan's corporate registrations and their beneficiaries. Without public access to this information, impartial public monitoring cannot be used to look into potential conflicts of interest or corruption issues in procurement. In particular, when the identities of beneficiaries and founders are concealed, the same individuals and corporations participate in repeated procurements under different company names, rendering e-procurement audits and public monitoring incapable of identifying and addressing corruption problems in this sector.

Having online access to the outcomes of supplier complaints is crucial. Civil society and the media can gather this information and identify common infractions if they are all put

on a single e-procurement portal after a view of supplier complaints regarding procurement or procedures. E-government efforts have gained popularity among governments in recent years due to their capacity to boost transparency and accountability while also bettering service delivery. However, several obstacles must be overcome before e-government programs can be put into action successfully (Babayev, 2018). In this study, we will assess the problems with present e-government delivery models and investigate several possible remedies. Globally, there has been a rise in the popularity of using digital services. The government of Azerbaijan is making similar investments in e-services to improve the quality of public sector operations. Nevertheless, even with these initiatives, there are still obstacles that must be overcome to guarantee the efficient delivery of e-services. In light of recent research, this study will assess the obstacles that must be overcome to enhance the provision of e-services in Azerbaijan. The **lack of a reliable mechanism** to assess e-services is one of the most pressing problems facing the Azerbaijani government. Alguliyev, Yusifov, and Gurbanli (2018) put out a framework and evaluation criteria for e-services in Azerbaijan in their research. The writers singled out factors such as **service quality, availability, ease of use, privacy protection, and customer satisfaction**. These criteria might be used to assess the efficiency of e-services and pinpoint places where they could be improved. Lack of public knowledge and education about the available services is another obstacle confronting Azerbaijan's e-service delivery. There is a large population that does not know about or uses government resources. As part of their suggested criteria for assessing the quality of e-services in Azerbaijan, Yusifov and Gurbanli (2018) emphasized the need of educating the general population. Public service announcements, billboards, and social media campaigns are all viable options for spreading the word. The availability of digital services is also a

major obstacle. People with disabilities have a hard time getting to public services since many ASAN Service facilities are inaccessible. All ASAN Service locations should be accessible to individuals with disabilities, and this should be a top priority (Jafarli, 2021). During our first meeting, **the Deputy Head of the Service Design and Evaluation Department** emphasized the need of the ASAN Service expanding its reach to underserved areas by offering new services.

Technology, insufficient security and privacy, distrust, lack of resources, digital fragmentation, poor management and infrastructure, a lack of understanding, legal impediments, a lack of IT infrastructure, and a lack of flexibility were all identified as obstacles (Guliyeva, & Rzayeva, 2018). The success of e-government projects has also been shown to depend on factors including citizen satisfaction, information accuracy, security, and privacy (Malik et al., 2016). Issues with e-government may be broken down into the following categories. E-government applications face a number of serious challenges, not the least of which are technological and infrastructure constraints. Many developing countries lack the necessary infrastructure to fully support e-government initiatives. This issue is a major contributor to the failure sometimes spectacular of government e-government initiatives. According to Gunawong & Gao, (2017), there is a widespread failure when underdeveloped countries try to adopt an e-government system built in a rich country. E-government initiatives need huge investments in IT infrastructure. E-government goes beyond providing basic technology resources like computers and fax machines to government agencies (Gunawong & Gao, 2017). Investments in information technology only become obsolete rapidly, necessitating public adoption, when advancements in IT lead to new possibilities in political and decision-making processes.

Privacy and Safety Concerns: From the first stages of planning to the latter stages of execution, security must be at the center of all activities. E-government, public institutions, the business sector, and people all benefit when they can conduct sensitive transactions in an atmosphere where they feel safe keeping their personal information private (Reffat, 2003). E-government transactions, like any other kind of electronic transaction, face security risks. Moreover, unlike more developed countries, emerging nations face security risks. Here, the state has to put in place strong safeguards to ensure that residents' private information stays that way. Internet privacy is another area of concern for government websites (Kassen, M. 2022). Personal information privacy is seen as an essential component of a functioning democratic society by several national constitutions, international treaties, and conventions. If people doing transactions online are even somewhat worried about who can access their data and how it might be used, they have effectively given up basic freedom. Someone else is in a better position to influence a person's choices and evaluate their character if they have access to that person's private information. Protecting privacy requires being aware of and in control of the distribution, storage, and use of individual data (Rahman, 2007).

Trust is the cornerstone of all human interactions. Therefore, religion also plays an important role in state-citizen interactions in this setting. Due to the open and accessible nature of e-government administration, it may play a pivotal role in restoring public faith (Khayyat, et al . 2020). However, there are a number of dangers inherent in doing business online, particularly in an electronic setting. Citizens' mistrust may be ameliorated by taking these precautions. Citizens' views of the many elements that feed their trust ought to evolve in a manner that increases trust in e-government (Reffat, 2003).

The state's budget made up of citizen taxes and other earnings, is supposed to provide all of its residents' requirements, from education and health care to security and justice (Fang, 2002). The dissemination of digital media has implications beyond the delivery of government services. Both developing and developed nations welcome this development and put money into it. In terms of economic and knowledge and technology production capabilities, developed nations have a leg up on developing countries and make substantial expenditures in this area (Muradov, 2022). The United States' early adoption of e-government projects and the high economic and technological development of advanced public service delivery nations are useful illustrations of this trend (Carter & Belanger, 2005). Despite many potential benefits, governments everywhere are struggling to provide sufficient funds for information and communication technology, particularly e-government programs. The high cost of infrastructure, software, and hardware for public institutions remains a major issue in the age of e-government applications (Kassen 2022). The expenditures associated with upkeep and repairs on the assets are also significant. Therefore, public institutions weigh the cost against the benefit, and the more cost-effective technology is more likely to be adopted. Improving e-service delivery requires overcoming several obstacles, including security and privacy concerns. The potential of e-government services in the fight against corruption was underlined by Chernov, Niyazov, Niyazova, and Bolgov (2020). To achieve this successfully, however, a strong security architecture must be in place to guard against cyber attacks and keep customers' data private. E-government, public institutions, the business sector, and people all benefit when they can conduct sensitive transactions in an atmosphere where they feel safe keeping their personal information private (Iskandarli, 2020). E-government transactions, like any other kind of electronic transaction, face security

risks. Moreover, unlike more developed countries, emerging nations face security risks. Here, the state has to put in place strong safeguards to ensure that residents' private information stays that way. Internet privacy is another area of concern for government websites (Panahov, 2016). Personal information privacy is seen as an essential component of a functioning democratic society by several national constitutions, international treaties, and conventions (Panahov, 2016). If people doing transactions online are even somewhat worried about who can access their data and how it might be used, they have effectively given up basic freedom. Someone else is in a better position to influence a person's choices and evaluate their character if they have access to that person's private information. Protecting privacy requires being aware of and in control of the distribution, storage, and use of individual data (Alguliyev, Aliguliyev & Yusifov, 2018). Large volumes of sensitive data, including names, addresses, and bank account numbers, are collected and stored by e-government systems. Therefore, protecting the confidentiality of this data is essential to gaining public support for e-government programs. The dangers of data breaches and cyber-attacks may be reduced if governments establish strong data protection and cybersecurity measures

Sadigova (2021) said that Azerbaijan's municipal governments' e-municipality systems needed to be upgraded. E-municipality technologies have the potential to make municipal governance more effective and open to the public. To reap these advantages, however, municipal governments must first update their information systems and provide employees with the necessary training to make the most of the upgraded technology. The digital gap is a major obstacle to e-government services. This is a measure of the divide between the technologically connected and those who are left out in the technological dark. Many people in third-world nations lack the technological know-how or access to the internet

to make advantage of e-government services. Because of this, only a select few people may be able to use e-government services, thus widening the gap between the haves and have-nots.

## Chapter 3: Policy Alternatives

In this chapter, we are going to analyze some of the policy options available to Azerbaijan in order to boost the quality of its public services. We will analyze how similar approaches have been implemented in other countries to enhance the availability and quality of public services. Hence in order to tackle with financial challenges, inefficiencies and accessibility barriers in public sector and operational, legal challenges this research will offer the following policy options.

### 3.1. Encouraging Public-Private Partnerships

In Chapter 2, we discussed the difficulties the public sectors in Azerbaijan have in terms of its budget. In this chapter, we are going to offer new policy and analyze how public-private partnerships (PPPs) may be able to help with these issues, as well as some of the other factors that need to be taken into account. The success or failure of PPPs is heavily dependent on the legal and regulatory framework enabling them such as lesson from Malasiya case (Kaliannan, 2010). Kaliannan, 2010 notes that it is crucial for both sectors to work together in the spirit of collaboration, mutual understanding, and consensus if Malaysia Incorporated is to be successfully implemented. The government has implemented a number of new programs with the goal of letting the private sector take the lead in driving economic growth. The goal of all of these initiatives is to make the country more economically competitive and stimulate growth in the economy. This shows that implementing this policy will address

financial challenges in public sector. It has been learned from experiences in other nations that delays and budget overruns may result from a lack of clarity on stakeholder duties and insufficient accountability procedures. Azerbaijan may prevent these kinds of problems by creating a robust legal and regulatory environment for public-private partnerships (PPPs). Procurement procedures, payment terms, risk sharing, and conflict resolution should all be spelt out in fine detail within this framework.

As noted in Many nations have turned to public-private partnerships (PPPs) to improve access to essential public services like healthcare, education, and new construction (Li and Akintoye, 2003). South Caucasus emerging nation Azerbaijan is likewise considering PPPs as a means to meet its infrastructure demands and boost its economy. Understanding the factors that led to the success or failure of PPPs in other countries will help Azerbaijan avoid making the same mistakes.

The strength of the legal and regulatory structure that underpins PPPs is a critical component in their eventual success or failure. Lack of clarity on the duties and obligations of the numerous stakeholders engaged in the projects and weak accountability mechanisms were cited as problems with Lebanon's legislative framework for PPPs. The PPPs' viability and their capacity to provide the promised advantages suffered as a result of the delays and cost overruns caused by this (Jamali, 2004). Azerbaijan may prevent such problems by establishing a complete regulatory and legal structure for PPPs that includes detailed rules for things like how to get things, how to pay for them, who gets what risks, and how to settle disagreements.

The selection of projects that are both economically and socially feasible is also crucial for PPPs. The Turkish government has actively encouraged public-private

partnerships (PPPs) in the healthcare sector, leading to the establishment of numerous major hospital construction initiatives. There was pushback from the public and opposing parties since some of these initiatives were seen as wasteful and overly expensive (Öge, & BAŞ, 2016). To guarantee that proposed PPP projects in Azerbaijan are in line with the country's development aims and demands, the government must conduct a thorough analysis of their economic and social viability. This may necessitate holding talks with local communities and civil society groups, as well as performing in-depth feasibility assessments.

The quality of the partnerships formed between the public and private sectors is equally crucial to the accomplishment of PPPs. For example, in Italy, public-private partnerships (PPPs) for essential healthcare services have been proven to be fruitful because of productive cooperation between public and private partners and the presence of solid governance and management frameworks (Cappellaro & Longo, 2011). However, in Turkey, there have been cases where private sector partners were accused of putting profits ahead of public interest, leading to friction and disagreement with the federal government (Ayhan & Üstüner, 2023). Azerbaijan must guarantee that public-private partnerships (PPPs) are built on a foundation of trust, transparency, and accountability and that proper protections are in place to prevent conflicts of interest and ensure contractual responsibilities are met.

Azerbaijan's public sector has budgetary constraints that might be alleviated by public-private partnerships. Azerbaijan can get the most advantages from PPPs while still protecting the public interest if it adopts a comprehensive legislative and regulatory framework, performs extensive project appraisals, cultivates solid partnerships, and employs effective risk management measures. The nation will be better able to satisfy its infrastructure needs and give its economy a boost as a result of these efforts.

### 3.2 Developing Feedback and Complaint Mechanisms in Azerbaijan

We noted that public sectors in Azerbaijan have some barriers through accessibility and inefficiencies in terms of service. If we want better public services that are also more accessible to the public, we need better ways for the public to provide input and lodge complaints. While the ASAN service does include a feedback mechanism, the same cannot be said of other public agencies. There have to be better avenues for citizens to provide feedback and lodge complaints in order to enhance Azerbaijan's public sector. This section of the capstone project draws on international precedents and applications to examine potential policy options for establishing efficient feedback and complaint channels in Azerbaijan.

Citizens who have concerns about the quality of government services can voice those concerns through a centralized complaints system. The process of filing a complaint and obtaining a response should be straightforward and simple to use. Romzek and Dubnick (1987) claimed that accountability measures were required to guarantee that public authorities were held responsible for their acts in the wake of the Challenger catastrophe. Accountability in Azerbaijan's government might be improved with the introduction of a centralized complaints system. There are a number of ways this complaint system might be implemented, such as through a mobile app or a dedicated website. To make sure people feel comfortable voicing their opinions, the system should include an option for residents to file concerns anonymously. Furthermore, public servants should be held accountable for resolving citizen concerns and enhancing the delivery of services in response to comments and suggestions. Public service innovation can be spurred by the information gained through user comments and concerns (Simmons and Brennan, 2017). The government of Azerbaijan

should actively solicit citizen complaints and suggestions in order to identify service gaps. Surveys, focus groups, and other internet tools like social media and email might all be used to collect this type of information. The government needs to make it easy for people to express input and lodge grievances, and then respond to those voices in a timely way. The quality of public services may also be enhanced by actively listening to and responding to citizen input and concerns.

Indicators of client orientation in the public sector include customer satisfaction, loyalty, and reputation (Andreassen, 1994). Officials in Azerbaijan should work to boost citizen contentment, loyalty, and the country's standing by enhancing the availability and quality of public services. Public leaders should boost satisfaction by prioritizing the efficient and effective delivery of public services. Service wait times, service quality, and service accessibility might all benefit from enhancements. Loyalty increases when residents believe their voices are heard and their concerns are addressed by their government. Reputation may be enhanced if public officials are open and responsible, and if they keep the public apprised of their actions and decisions.

### 3.3 Municipality Mobile App Design

As we mentioned in Chapter 2 that the public sector (specially municipal administrations) in Azerbaijan has operational, legal, and ethical challenges and in order to adress this challanges we offer that too have some digital platforms such as municipality mobile app. Numerous studies have examined the best practices for designing mobile apps for municipal administrations. Lev-On and Rosenberg (2021) researched the use of mobile apps in local government and concluded that they have the potential to increase public participation and enhance service quality. Mobile app usage was broken down into four main

categories: service provisioning, communication, user engagement, and user involvement. They also stressed the need to make the app accessible to those with different capacities, such as the elderly and young children. Research on the growth of mobile applications in two rural South African towns was undertaken by Jacobs, Rivett, and Chemisto (2019). Co-design was crucial to the completion of the project, they concluded. Citizens and other interested parties work together throughout the co-design phase to refine the app's features and functionality until they're perfect. The authors also stressed the significance of educating municipal staff to guarantee proper app utilization. Mobile GIS application created by Ekstedt and Endoff (2012) for use in municipal fieldwork in Sweden. The program was developed so that city workers may look up data regarding city infrastructure from their mobile devices. The authors concluded that the software significantly boosted the productivity and precision of their fieldwork. The Italian road traffic management platform was created by Foschini, Taleb, Corradi, and Bottazzi (2011). The platform utilized M2M connectivity to provide continuous traffic monitoring. Congestion was reduced, and overall traffic safety was enhanced, according to the authors of the platform. The evolution of municipal government mobile applications in Azerbaijan is in its infancy. However, the use of mobile apps to enhance government services has enormous potential. Mobile apps for municipal service provision, communication, engagement, and involvement are possible. Citizens may use a smartphone app to report problems like potholes and malfunctioning lamps, for instance. The software might also be used to disseminate data about city services, such as trash pickup times. There can be no successful mobile app development without the co-design process. Local governments in Azerbaijan should solicit feedback from residents to refine the app's features. Training for municipal workers on how to utilize the app properly is also necessary. In

conclusion, the use of mobile applications has tremendous potential to enhance Azerbaijan's public sector. Mobile apps for municipal service delivery, communication, citizen engagement, and citizen involvement should be designed and developed. Training for municipal personnel to guarantee they can efficiently utilize the app is also necessary to ensure the success of the project, as is the co-design process.

### 3.4 Improvement of e-Procurement Mechanism and Application

Besides mobile apps government authorities can develop some mechanism for handling with operational legal, and ethical challenges such as improvement e-procurement mechanism and application. E-procurement, or electronic procurement, is the process of electronically automating the acquisition of products and services over the Internet. It helps buyers and sellers communicate effectively and expedite the purchasing procedure. Numerous nations employ this strategy, which has yielded substantial public and private sector benefits wherever it has been implemented. This section will examine many case studies of international e-procurement initiatives and the results achieved by such initiatives.

E-procurement has been used by the government sector in several countries, including Malaysia. Aman and Kasimin's (2011) research on the impact of e-procurement on the Malaysian government revealed that it greatly enhanced the performance of the procurement department. According to the research, e-procurement has helped businesses save money, be more transparent, and be held more accountable. It has shortened the procurement process, decreased the amount of paperwork involved, and boosted the involvement of small and medium-sized businesses.

In 2005, the Dutch government implemented a nationwide e-procurement system, providing another example of successful e-procurement deployment. All public procurement

notices can now be posted on TenderNed's website, and bids can be submitted electronically. According to research conducted by Batenburg (2007), several factors, such as company size, industry, and market rivalry, affect the rate at which European companies use e-procurement systems. E-procurement's implementation in the Netherlands has been fruitful, the study concluded, leading to more productivity, lower expenditures, and simpler access for vendors.

Concerns over data privacy and security have slowed the adoption of e-procurement in the United States. Voss (2015) conducted research on the privacy and security concerns associated with e-procurement in the context of the TTIP discussions between the European Union and the US. The research concluded that e-procurement poses serious security and privacy threats, notably in the areas of data collecting and storage. To reduce these dangers, the report suggested putting in place stringent data protection procedures.

In 2018, Azerbaijan implemented an electronic procurement system, and the Law on Public Procurement was updated to reflect this (Ibadoghlu & Bayramov, 2019). Due to the new regulations, electronic purchasing is essential. These regulations mandate that all relevant information regarding public procurements (including announcements, results, information on contracts signed as a result of tenders, service proposals from procuring entities, qualification suitability determination proposals, etc.) be made publicly available on the official portal. Unfortunately, only the technical benefits of this system are typically highlighted. For instance, reducing or doing away with the need for paper can save money and time. However, e-procurement's primary objective must be to identify and remove corruption risks. Modules should be built into the electronic system to help the media and civil society spot potential conflicts of interest and unethical practices in procurement as soon as they arise. When it comes to public scrutiny, the system should function such that all

parties interested in procurement details have unrestricted access to the internet platforms. Products need to be cataloged electronically. Using the categorization codes for all items that the procurement entities would need in practice, a comprehensive catalog can be compiled.

Online transparency raises the bar for public servants' responsibility and responsiveness in serving the public. From this perspective, guaranteeing procurement transparency, accountability, and availability of information is the key requirement for civil society and the media to regularly monitor public procurement. For instance, it's crucial that technical specifications and other procurement documentation be made available to the general public. **Access to the database** in Azerbaijan is limited, despite the fact that this method has been utilized effectively in Turkey (Gurakar & Tas, 2016).

Certain works have been carried out in this direction in Azerbaijan in the past years and now. According to the amendment made on December 28, 2018 in the Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan "On Public Procurement", electronicization of tenders between 50 thousand AZN and 3 million dollars (5.1 million AZN) is provided. Based on this, a single internet portal of public procurements, [etender.gov.az](http://etender.gov.az), was created under the organization of the former Electronic Government Development Center (now the Agency for Innovation and Digital Development). In order to increase efficiency in this area, government procurement should be completely paperless and all processes should be digitized.

## Chapter 4. Evaluation of Policy Alternatives

In this part, each policy proposal that is discussed in the preceding chapter will be assessed based on the five criteria that are listed below: effectiveness, productivity, transparency, cost/applicability, and practicability.

## **Encouraging Public-Private Partnerships**

Providing public services and building public infrastructure through public-private partnerships (PPPs) has grown in popularity in recent years. Public-private partnerships (PPPs) are beneficial because they combine the knowledge and resources of the public and private sectors. Some public-private partnership (PPP) projects in Azerbaijan have been completed in recent years, including the Baku-Tbilisi-Ceyhan oil pipeline. However, there is room for more. Public-private partnerships (PPPs) have been proven to be beneficial in delivering a variety of construction and government-funded projects, including those in the fields of transportation, energy, healthcare, and education. PPPs might be just as successful in Azerbaijan as they have been elsewhere; there cannot be reason to expect otherwise. There are anticipated to be many prospects for PPPs in sectors including energy, logistics, and healthcare in Azerbaijan because of the country's advantageous position as a transit hub and its fast-expanding economy. Project-based partnerships (PPPs) have the potential to be productive in a number of other ways as well, including via the timely and cost-effective completion of projects and the introduction of novel ideas and methods to enhance production. Public-private partnerships may be used to better deliver services and build the infrastructure Azerbaijan needs. Public-private partnerships in Azerbaijan can assist meet the country's infrastructure demands in key sectors including transportation, electricity, and communications. PPPs may be used to provide access to high-speed internet, modernize energy infrastructure, build new roadways and trains, and more. PPPs have the potential to boost productivity, enhance service delivery, and lower costs since they make use of private sector experience and resources. The lack of transparency that sometimes characterizes PPPs raises legitimate concerns. PPPs can reduce transparency in decision-making and project

results due to the private sector's involvement and the complexity of the resulting contractual structures. But there are measures that can be taken to guarantee openness in PPPs. For instance, the process can be governed by explicit norms and laws that guarantee all parties involved have access to the necessary data. In addition, consistent reporting and monitoring can assist spot problems early on and correcting them before they impact the project's progress. One issue with PPPs is that they may end up costing more than conventional methods of public procurement. This is due to the fact that private investors often demand a higher return on their money, driving up the total cost of the project. However, the increased efficiency and improved outcomes typically associated with PPPs can more than makeup for this additional cost. PPPs are most useful if there is an obvious economic rationale for enlisting the assistance of the private sector. Some examples of sectors where private sector knowledge and resources may be used to improve outcomes include the transportation industry, the energy sector, and the healthcare sector. Other sectors, such as education and social services, can also benefit from PPPs.

Municipality Mobile App Design and Developing Feedback and Complaint Mechanisms in Azerbaijan stand out as the most efficient and feasible policies after being compared to four other potential solutions to the problems plaguing the public sector in Azerbaijan. There is hope that Azerbaijan's new policy on municipal mobile app design would boost participation from the general public and make municipal services more effective. The evaluation criteria of efficacy, productivity, openness, cost/applicability, and practicality were all met. With the right amount of advertising and promotion, the app may be extensively accepted in Azerbaijan, as it has done with great success in other countries. All four assessment criteria were fulfilled or exceeded by the policy titled "Developing

Feedback and Complaint Mechanisms in Azerbaijan," making it a viable alternative. The policy has the potential to increase government agencies' openness and accountability, as well as to address some of the problems with operations involved in providing effective and readily available public services. Chatbots and other forms of AI can streamline the process through which citizens complain to their government and receive a response. The Azerbaijani government should prioritize enacting these two measures in order to strengthen the public sector. Organizing, evaluation, and monitoring are crucial to ensuring these policies are successful in Azerbaijan and fulfilling their intended aims, and addressing the unique issues facing the public sector there.

### **Developing Feedback and Complaint Mechanisms in Azerbaijan**

Improving Azerbaijan's administration may be accomplished through the creation of channels for citizen feedback and grievances. It's a way for people to get their voices heard by the government so that problems may be solved. These systems can increase confidence and encourage individuals to get involved in governance by facilitating two-way communication. In Azerbaijan, the "ASAN Service" centers are a great place to voice concerns and get answers. These hubs are equipped with a feedback system and serve as a single point of contact for residents to access a wide range of government services. Citizens are encouraged to provide their thoughts on the facility's performance in order to enhance the range of services offered. The level of citizen satisfaction with government services in Azerbaijan has increased because of this method. Creating channels for citizen comments and grievances is another way to boost efficiency in Azerbaijan's public sector. These procedures can assist expedite government operations and boost service quality by recognizing and resolving citizen concerns. In the long run, this might mean lower taxes and

a more efficient government. The "ASAN Service" facilities, for instance, have helped cut down on wait times for official business in Azerbaijan. The centers have increased efficiency and decreased wait times for individuals seeking government services by centralizing such services from across several departments into a single location.

Government agencies in Azerbaijan can become more open to the public if feedback and complaint channels are established. These procedures can help to ensure that government entities are held responsible for their activities by giving citizens a forum to air their grievances. This has the potential to improve openness and decrease corruption. The "E-gov" portal in Azerbaijan provides an open platform for citizen comments and complaints. Citizens can use this hub to provide comments and lodge complaints about government services, which are subsequently tracked by the appropriate departments. The portal's ability to keep individuals apprised of the progression of their complaints is another way in which it promotes openness and trust in government. Azerbaijan's governance might be strengthened at a low cost by instituting more formal channels for citizen feedback and complaints. Legal action and other kinds of dispute resolution can be avoided by using these procedures to resolve citizen complaints and concerns. In addition, these techniques are simple to deploy and need nothing in the way of initial and continuing maintenance expenditures.

Feedback and complaint methods are generally applicable in many different contexts in Azerbaijan. They can be used in public services like healthcare and education, as well as in national, regional, and municipal governance. However, it's worth noting that these safeguards might work best in urban areas with widespread access to the internet and smartphone use. More work has to be done to spread awareness of these tools in rural areas and communities where smartphone use is less common. Azerbaijan has a viable policy

option to develop feedback and complaint channels. Azerbaijan may learn from the various feedback and complaint channels already in place in other nations. "ASAN Service" centers and the "E-gov" webpage are only two examples of the initiatives the government of Azerbaijan has done to improve feedback and complaint channels. But we must make sure that these tools are available to all citizens, no matter their background or education. Widespread education and training for citizens who are unfamiliar with these systems are also necessary. To maintain the sustainability of government structures and procedures, it is also crucial to include feedback and complaint systems.

### **Municipality Mobile App Design**

To what extent the goals of the policy option for mobile app design are met is a good indicator of its efficacy. In the case of the municipality's mobile app, the desired objective is to boost people's involvement in municipal decision-making and administration. The software has the potential to boost civic participation and promote better transparency and accountability in local administration by offering a user-friendly and easily accessible platform for residents to communicate with their local government. The app's success will hinge on its design and features, the number of people who know about it and are inspired to use it, and the degree to which local government acts on suggestions made by app users. Designing the app so that it is easy to understand and use, spreading the word and getting people to download it, and having a system in place to receive and act on user feedback are all crucial to the app's success. The efficiency of the city's mobile app may be gauged by how much it helps in streamlining municipal administration. The software might save time and energy for both residents and government officials by eliminating the need for them to physically attend meetings or submit documents to their local government.

The software might also give local government officials a more streamlined method of collecting and analyzing citizen feedback, which would aid in informing decision-making and ultimately provide better policy outcomes. The success of the app, however, will rely on how much residents and government employees utilize it. Significant productivity gains may be impossible to attain if the app is not widely adopted or integrated into existing government processes. Government accountability and public confidence may be strengthened via increased transparency. By providing a more direct and easily accessible platform for citizens to interact with their local government, the municipality mobile app has the potential to improve the openness and accountability of local governance. The app's potential to increase openness, however, is contingent on a number of conditions. The first step is to ensure that the app is open and easy to use, with well-defined parameters for the collection and utilization of citizen feedback. Second, the government must listen to citizens' concerns and take appropriate action based on those concerns in an open and responsible fashion. Last but not least, the app needs widespread use by people and government employees alike to be a successful instrument for fostering openness in municipal administration. There are a number of variables that will affect the long-term cost and use of the municipality's mobile app, such as the app's design and functionality, the ease with which it can be incorporated into current government procedures, and the expense of building and maintaining the app.

Budgeting for app creation, maintenance, and continuous support, among other things, will be necessary to keep the app up and running. This may be a fair price to pay if the app leads to higher levels of citizen participation and better municipal government. In terms of usability, the app is most likely to succeed in metropolitan centers where smartphone use and internet access are both widespread. The feasibility of the app's creation and rollout

is hampered by the potential need for substantial financial, technical, and human resources. The city may have to set aside funds for the app's creation and upkeep, find or hire app designers and programmers, and offer users tutorials and assistance. In addition to input from individuals and community organizations, the development and launch of the app may involve interaction with other government departments. Municipalities may need to take various actions to ensure the success of the policy alternative, recruiting stakeholders and partners to aid in the app's development and rollout, and spreading the word about the app via a variety of mediums. It's possible that the city will need to keep tabs on the app's usage statistics, compile user comments, and make modifications depending on what it learns.

### **Improvement of e-Procurement Mechanism and Application**

The efficiency of Azerbaijan's procurement procedures stands to gain a great deal from the introduction of an e-procurement framework and application. The solution may speed up the procurement process, minimize the potential for corruption, and improve efficiency by offering a single hub for all purchasing activities. In addition, computerized bidding might bring in more potential vendors, which can boost price competitiveness. Overall, an electronic procurement system may boost efficiency, leading to better results for both the public and the government. Productivity in procurement operations may be significantly increased by the use of an e-procurement system. The technology allows procurement authorities to devote more time to strategic endeavors by automating many of the administrative processes connected with procurement, like documentation and record-keeping. Also, the system can shorten the time it takes to acquire goods and services by streamlining the procurement procedure itself. The government's bottom line and public welfare might both benefit from these efficiencies.

Transparency is a major benefit of an electronic procurement system. The system may guarantee that all parties have access to the same data on procurement procedures by serving as a single hub for all procurement-related activities. This has the potential to boost confidence in the bidding process and cut down on instances of corruption. In addition to improving openness and accountability, computerized bidding can guarantee that all proposals are examined equally and objectively. Implementing an electronic procurement system might be expensive, depending on the needs of the organization and the level of customization necessary. The savings from improved efficiency and less corruption, however, may more than makeup for the initial investment. Organizations and government entities with sizable procurement needs are the best candidates for the system. The system works best when it is widely implemented since that increases competition and decreases prices. Large amounts of time, money, and knowledge are needed to successfully develop an e-procurement system. The government must spend money on equipment and software, as well as on training and assistance for its employees. It will also be necessary to tailor the system to the peculiarities of government procurement procedures. To ensure the system's effectiveness and efficiency, it must be thoroughly integrated with current procurement procedures. In spite of these obstacles, moving to an e-procurement system has the potential to greatly enhance both the efficiency and effectiveness of the procurement process.

Overall, there are two policies that have shown be successful, efficient, feasible, equitable, and adaptable. Both "Municipality Mobile App Design" and "Developing Feedback and Complaint Mechanisms" would be highly recommended for Azerbaijan's policymakers. These policies may drastically alter public sectors, raise public participation, and improve service quality. Azerbaijan may promote accountability, transparency, and

public autonomy, leading to a more effective and responsive public sectors, if it makes the execution of these policies a top priority and provides the required resources.

<b>Policy Options</b>	<b>Effectiveness</b>	<b>Efficiency</b>	<b>Feasibility</b>	<b>Equity</b>	<b>Flexibility</b>
Encouraging Public-Private Partnerships	✓	✓	✓	-	✓
Developing Feedback and Complaint Mechanisms	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Municipality Mobile App Design	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Improvement of e-Procurement Mechanism and App	✓	✓	✓	-	✓

## Chapter 5. Conclusion and Recommendation

In conclusion, citizen contentment and the state's ability to provide essential services depend on the caliber of those services. Azerbaijan, like many other nations, struggles to provide citizens with high-quality, easily accessible public services due to financial and operational constraints. Azerbaijan's public sector has been hampered by financial issues, making it unable to provide citizens with high-quality services. The ever-increasing needs of the industrial industry have made it difficult to keep up with revenue fluctuations and budgetary limitations. While it is important for states to bring in cash, this can't be at the expense of the economy or workers' ability to put in more hours. The ASAN Service is an admirable effort that has increased the reliability and effectiveness of government programs in Azerbaijan. The ASAN Service has run into problems that make it difficult to offer high-quality public services to the people of Azerbaijan. A major problem that needs fixing is people not being informed or educated enough about the ASAN Service and the help it can give. If the ASAN Service wants more individuals to make use of its resources, it will need to increase its public outreach activities. Customer satisfaction can only be measured if there are processes in place for constant monitoring, assessment, and feedback. E-government services are a vital component of the new management paradigm, open government initiatives, and the modernization of public administration. However, there are a number of practical, moral, and legal issues that must be resolved in the rollout of e-government services. To maintain the security of personal information used by e-government services, the Azerbaijani government must implement stringent security and privacy regulations. To further safeguard citizens' rights and forestall the abuse of e-government data, regulatory structures should be put in place.

Overall, the delivery of high-quality public services is a process that calls for constant iteration, improvement, and creativity. The government of Azerbaijan must maintain its dedication to providing its population with high-quality public services notwithstanding the difficulties in doing so. Azerbaijan can deliver the quality public services its inhabitants deserve with the use of modern technology, enhanced regulations and processes, and efficient monitoring and feedback systems.

Below is a list of suggestions for how Azerbaijan might better provide its citizens with essential services:

1. The government should increase financing for public services in order to emphasize the improvement of those services. This would entail looking for new revenue streams to bolster funding for public services and building essential infrastructure like roads, bridges, and schools.
2. The ASAN Service, along with other public agencies, must do a better job of informing the public about the benefits they may receive from using them. If the government wants people to know about its services and how to make good use of them, it must engage in increased public outreach.
3. The government must implement strong security and privacy rules to protect personal information submitted to or gathered by e-government services. To further safeguard citizens' rights and forestall the abuse of e-government data, regulatory structures should be put in place.
4. The ASAN Service should not be the primary focus of government efforts to boost consumer satisfaction. The degree of client happiness may be measured and problem areas can be pinpointed through regular monitoring, evaluation, and feedback systems.

5. Put up creative ideas The government should look at creative ways to enhance public services, such as using technology to reduce redundancies and boost productivity. Financial savings, greater productivity, and expanded access to public services are all possible outcomes of adopting digital technologies.
6. The government should encourage collaboration between the public and private sectors to enhance the quality of public services, which leads us to recommendation number six: increase collaboration between the public and private sectors. The private sector may help make public services more efficient and successful by contributing knowledge, materials, and money.
7. The government should place a high value openness and accountability in the delivery of public services. This includes developing transparent decision-making procedures, enforcing open data standards, and holding government officials responsible for their conduct.

## REFERENCES

- Abbasov, A. M., Mamedov, Z. F., & Aliev, S. A. (2019). Digitalization of the banking sector: new challenges and prospects. *Economics and management*, (6), 81-89.
- About us - ASAN. (n.d.). About Us - ASAN. <https://asan.gov.az/en/about>
- Alguliyev, R., Aliguliyev, R., & Yusifov, F. (2018). Role of social networks in E-government: Risks and security threats. *Online Journal of Communication and Media Technologies*, 8(4), 363-376.
- Alguliyev, R., Yusifov, F., & Gurbanli, A. (2018). Methodology and Criteria for Evaluating E-Services: The Case of Azerbaijan. *JeDEM-eJournal of eDemocracy and Open Government*, 10(1), 106-115. [http://crrc.az/wpcontent/uploads/2014/12/StudySeriesOnPublicPolicyIssues\\_EPF\\_CRR\\_CAz\\_Baku2018.pdf#page=198](http://crrc.az/wpcontent/uploads/2014/12/StudySeriesOnPublicPolicyIssues_EPF_CRR_CAz_Baku2018.pdf#page=198)
- Alguliyev, R., Yusifov, F., & Gurbanli, A. (2018). Methodology and Criteria for Evaluating E-Services: The Case of Azerbaijan. *JeDEM-eJournal of eDemocracy and Open Government*, 10(1), 106-115.
- Aliyev, A. G. Problems of Regulation and Prospective Development of E-commerce Systems in the Post-coronavirus Era.
- Aliyeva, S. (2020). Civic Engagement in Azerbaijan. *International Journal of Civil Service Reform and Practice*, 5(2).
- Aman, A., & Kasimin, H. (2011). E-procurement implementation: a case of Malaysia government. *Transforming Government: People, Process and Policy*, 5(4), 330-344.

Andreassen, T. W. (1994). Satisfaction, loyalty, and reputation as indicators of customer orientation in the public sector. *International Journal of Public Sector Management*, 7(2), 16-34.

Asgarova, (2020) B. E-Government Technology Transfer Project from Developed to Developing Countries. A Case Study of the Implementation of the ASAN Imza (Mobile ID) in Azerbaijan

Ayhan, B., & Üstüner, Y. (2023). Turkey's public-private partnership experience: A political economy perspective. *Southeast European and Black Sea Studies*, 23(1), 115-138.

Azerbaijani Service and Assessment Network (ASAN). (2016) Centre for Public Impact (CPI). <https://www.centreforpublicimpact.org/case-study/azerbaijani-service-and-assessment-network-asan>

Babayev, E. A. (2018). Electronic Government as an Element of the Digital Economy: Experience of the Republic of Azerbaijan. Administrative Consulting.

Bashirov, G. (2021). New extractive and failed development in Azerbaijan. *Third World Quarterly*, 42(8), 1829-1848.

Bakuresearchinstitute (2020) The Impact of Oil Price Shocks on The Economy of Azerbaijan: A Vector – Autoregressive Analysis  
<https://bakuresearchinstitute.org/en/the-impact-of-oil-price-shocks-on-the-economy-of-azerbaijan-2/>

Batenburg, R. (2007). E-procurement adoption by European firms: A quantitative analysis. *Journal of Purchasing and supply management*, 13(3), 182-192.

Brennan, C., & Douglas, A. (2002). Complaints procedures in local government: informing your customers. *International journal of public sector management*.

Cappellaro, G., & Longo, F. (2011). Institutional public-private partnerships for core health services: evidence from Italy. *BMC Health Services Research*, 11(1), 1-9.

Chernov, I., Niyazov, N., Niyazova, G., & Bolgov, R. (2020). E-Government as a Tool in the Fight Against Corruption: Case of Azerbaijan. In *Electronic Governance and Open Society: Challenges in Eurasia: 6th International Conference, EGOSE 2019, St. Petersburg, Russia, November 13–14, 2019, Proceedings 6* (pp. 258-269). Springer International Publishing.

Ekstedt, G., & Endoff, T. (2012). Design and development of a mobile GIS application for municipal fieldwork. Tech. rep., Lund Technical University.

Foschini, L., Taleb, T., Corradi, A., & Bottazzi, D. (2011). M2M-based metropolitan platform for IMS-enabled road traffic management in IoT. *IEEE Communications Magazine*, 49(11), 50-57. <https://ieeexplore.ieee.org/abstract/document/6069709>

Gahramanova, A. (2009). Internal and external factors in the democratization of Azerbaijan. *Democratization*, 16(4), 777-

803. <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/13510340903083919>

Guliyev, F. (2015). The Informal Economy in Azerbaijan. *Caucasus Analytical Digest*, (75).

Guliyeva, A., & Rzayeva, U. (2018). The Role of E-government in Reduction of Information Asymmetry in Developing Countries on the Example of Azerbaijan. *Advances in Economics and Business*, 6(4), 209-217.

Gunawong, P., & Gao, P. (2017). Understanding e-government failure in the developing country context: a process-oriented study. *Information technology for development*, 23(1), 153-178.

Gurakar, E. C., & Tas, B. K. O. (2016). Does public e-procurement deliver what it promises? Empirical evidence from Turkey. *Emerging Markets Finance and Trade*, 52(11), 2669-2684.

Gurbanov, N., Yagublu, N., Akbarli, N., & Niftiyev, I. (2022). Digitalization and the Covid-19-Led Public Crisis Management: An Evaluation of Financial Sustainability in the Azerbaijan Business Sector. *Socioeconomic Challenges (SEC)*, 6(3), 23-38. <https://sciendo.com/article/10.21272/sec.63.23-38.2022>

Hajiyeva, L. (2021). The prospects and problems of e-commerce in Azerbaijan in the context of globalization. In *SHS Web of Conferences* (Vol. 92, p. 06010). EDP Sciences.

Huseynova, A., & Mazanova, O. (2020). Expansion Of E-Services In Azerbaijan: Directions And Perspectives. *Economic and Social Development: Book of Proceedings*, 2, 656-662.

Huseynova, N. (2014). EFFECTIVE TRAINING SYSTEM IS ONE OF THE PRINCIPLES BRAND OF AZERBAIJAN MANAGEMENT “ASAN SERVICE”. J. Int. Sci. Publ, 12

Ibadoghlu, G., & Bayramov, G. (2019). Assessment on the Implementation of the National Action Plan on Promotion of the Open Government Initiative in Azerbaijan for 2016-2018'. Public Initiatives Center, Baku.

Ibadoghlu, G., & Bayramov, G. (2019). Assessment on the Implementation of National Action Plan on Promotion of the Open Government Initiative in Azerbaijan for 2016-2018'. Public Initiatives Center,

Baku.[https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract\\_id=3336309](https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=3336309)

İbrahimova, K. (2019). Influence of innovations on economic development in Azerbaijan. In Influence of Innovations on Economic Development in Azerbaijan: İbrahimova, Khayala.

Iskandarli, G. Y. (2020). Applying clustering and topic modeling to automatic analysis of citizens' comments in E-Government. *International Journal of Information Technology and Computer Science*, 12(6), 1-10. Lev-On, A., & Rosenberg, H. (2021). Mobile applications in local government. *Electronic Government, an International Journal*, 17(2), 183-198.<https://www.inderscienceonline.com/doi/abs/10.1504/EG.2021.114578>

Jacobs, C., Rivett, U., & Chemisto, M. (2019). Developing capacity through co-design: The case of two municipalities in rural South Africa. *Information Technology for Development*, 25(2), 204-226.<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/02681102.2018.1470488>

Jafarli, I. (2021). Effective Public Service Delivery: The Case of Azerbaijan. *International Journal of Civil Service Reform and Practice*, 6(1).

Jamali, D. (2004). Success and failure mechanisms of public-private partnerships (PPPs) in developing countries: Insights from the Lebanese context. *International Journal of Public Sector Management*, 17(5), 414-430.

Kassen, M. (2022). Blockchain and e-government innovation: Automation of public information processes. *Information Systems*, 103, 101862.

Kaya, M., & Cetin, E. (2009). Harnessing ICT to Improve E-Government and E-Governance. In *First International Conference on Advances in E-Government and E-Governance (ICEGOV-2009)*, Ed. by. Kaplan A., Balçı A., Aktan, CC and Dalbay, O., Ankara-Turkey (Vol. 1, pp. 79-95).

Kaliannan, M., Awang, H., & Raman, M. (2010). Public-private partnerships for e-government services: lessons from Malaysia. *Institutions and Economies*, 207-220.

Khasmammadli, G., & Erlenheim, R. (2022, October). Citizens' Readiness for Proactive Public Services: A case study from Azerbaijan. In *Proceedings of the 15th International Conference on Theory and Practice of Electronic Governance* (pp. 408-415).

Khan, M. U. H. (2016). Fascinating Azerbaijan. *Defence Journal*, 20(4), 36.

Li, B., & Akintoye, A. (2003). An overview of public-private partnership. *Public-private partnerships: Managing risks and opportunities*, 3-30.

Malik, B. H., Shuqin, C., Mastoi, A. G., Gul, N., & Gul, H. (2016). Evaluating citizen e-satisfaction from e-government services: A case of Pakistan. *European Scientific Journal*, 12(5).

Mulgan, G., & Albury, D. (2003). Innovation in the public sector. Strategy Unit, Cabinet Office, 1(1), 40.

Muradov, İ. (2022). Problems Of E-Governance İn Government Agencies And Their Solutions.

Murteza, H. (2021). DIGITAL TRANSFORMATION IN DELIVERY OF PUBLIC SERVICES: THE EXAMPLE OF AZERBAIJAN. In *DIGITAL CONTENT FOR SOCIAL AND ECOSYSTEM DEVELOPMENT OF THE ECONOMY* (pp. 89-93).

Öge, H., & BAŞ, T. (2016). Public–private partnership healthcare projects in Turkey. *The Journal of Business Science*, 4(2), 105-119.

Panahov, H. (2016). Cyber-Security Challenges in Azerbaijan. *Baku Dialogues*, 3(1), 1-6.

Presutti Jr, W. D. (2003). Supply management and e-procurement: creating value added in the supply chain. *Industrial marketing management*, 32(3), 219-226.

Reffat, R. (2003). Developing successful e-government. *Proc. Sympos. e-Government: Opportunities and Challenge, Muscat Municipality, Oman, IV1–IV13*.

Romzek, B. S., & Dubnick, M. J. (1987). Accountability in the public sector: Lessons from the Challenger tragedy. *Public administration review*, 227-238.], [Simmons, R., & Brennan,

C. (2017). User voice and complaints as drivers of innovation in public services. *Public Management Review*, 19(8), 1085-1104.

Sadigova, Z. (2021). THE IMPROVEMENT OF E-MUNICIPALITY SYSTEMS IN AZERBAIJAN LOCAL GOVERNMENTS. *Economic and Social Development: Book of Proceedings*, 483-492.

Sadik-Zada, E. R., Gatto, A., & Niftiyev, I. (2022). E-government and petty corruption in public sector service delivery. *Technology Analysis & Strategic Management*, 1-17.

*The opening of the “ASAN service” Center No 3 of the State Agency for Public Services and Social Innovation has been held in Baku.* (n.d.). The Opening of the “ASAN Service” Center No 3 of the State Agency for Public Services and Social Innovation Has Been Held in Baku. <https://vxside.gov.az/en/news/909>

The State Agency for Public Service and Social Innovations under the president of the Republic of Azerbaijan (2013) The opening of the ‘ASAN service’ Center No 3 of the State Agency for Public Services and Social Innovation has been held in Baku. Available at: <https://vxside.gov.az/en/news/909>

Verma, N., & Mishra, A. (2010). India's approach in constructing a one-stop solution towards e-government. *Journal of E-Governance*, 33(3), 144-156.

Voss, W. G. (2015). Security and Privacy Implications of e-Procurement in the TTIP. *The Transatlantic Trade and Investment Partnership (TTIP) Negotiations between the EU and the USA*, 73.

Yoon, S. (2019). Azerbaijan: Country digital development overview. <https://think-asia.org/handle/11540/9887>

Yusifov, F., & Gurbanli, A. (2018). E-services evaluation criteria: The case of Azerbaijan. *Information & Media*, 81, 18-26.

Yusifov, F., & Gurbanli, A. (2018). E-services evaluation criteria: The case of Azerbaijan. *Information & Media*, 81, 18-26.

Yoon, S. (2019). Azerbaijan Country digital development overview. <https://think-asia.org/handle/11540/9887>

Zeynalov, A. (2021). ORGANIZATIONAL CITIZENSHIP BEHAVIOR IN AZERBAIJAN: THE CASE OF ASAN SERVICE. *Bulletin of the Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv. Public Administration*, 14(2), 10-13.

Zhang, N., Lu, Z., & Shou, Y. (2017). The dominant role of governing structure in a cross-sector collaboration in developing China: Two case studies of information integration in local government one-stop services. *Information Technology for Development*, 23(3), 554-578.

## Appendix

First interview:

[https://drive.google.com/file/d/1qwX2pfZZwdqFK\\_VbjM0iU7ctPAFyjbT/view?usp=share\\_link](https://drive.google.com/file/d/1qwX2pfZZwdqFK_VbjM0iU7ctPAFyjbT/view?usp=share_link)

Second interview:

[https://drive.google.com/file/d/1iZq\\_7NOUbA-iDJztoD4u5RqydbX10dI7/view?usp=share\\_link](https://drive.google.com/file/d/1iZq_7NOUbA-iDJztoD4u5RqydbX10dI7/view?usp=share_link)

Third interview:

[https://docs.google.com/document/d/1mPQktR0hH9a21z2ouXqM6zy0ijhwMP3E/edit?usp=share\\_link&oid=10442668436225253274&rtpof=true&sd=true](https://docs.google.com/document/d/1mPQktR0hH9a21z2ouXqM6zy0ijhwMP3E/edit?usp=share_link&oid=10442668436225253274&rtpof=true&sd=true)